#### Information Literacy and the Marketplace of Anxieties

Ontario Library Association Superconference, February 2005 Barbara Fister, Gustavus Adolphus College

#### Introduction

Promoting information literacy is a priority for academic librarians. We work hard to forge alliances across campus to help our students gain skills we feel they need for college and beyond. It's a worthwhile cause - but we could deepen our fundamental concept of what we mean by information literacy by borrowing insights from cognate approaches.

The <u>Information Literacy Competency Standards for Higher Education</u> frame the process as beginning with individuals articulating an information need. To satisfy that need, they find, evaluate, and use information while complying with legal and ethical norms. This description of the process treats information as granular bits of data - discrete, neutral, and decontextualized. The thing that glues it together is the seeker's need. Information is "out there," and the user finds and uses what he or she needs.

A parallel cause, more advanced in Canada than in the U.S., is *media literacy*. Media literacy reverses the process: it is framed around ubiquitous media channels to which audiences are exposed; media literacy provides skills for audiences to interpret messages are thrust upon them. (Interestingly, the U.S. version tends to focus on teaching young audiences to protect themselves from messages about sex and violence; the Canadian version teaches critical awareness of political and economic persuasion.) Though media and information literacy have similar goals, they start with very different assumptions and there's surprisingly little communication between the two movements.

Communication Studies is an interdisciplinary field that offers a lot of potential for information literacy. It examines the entire process of creation, transmission, and reception of messages and acknowledges that these are not linear but interdependent, operating within a dynamic and volatile social context. What communication studies offers is a nuanced understanding of how messages are constructed by media and the role that audiences play in receiving and influencing those messages. Speaker, audience, and message interact within a social context that influences all three.

Finally, the field of *Cultural Studies* adds another dimension: an examination of the power relationships within those relationships. It theorizes the politics of the cultural practices that shape our lives with the belief that understanding those practices and the power dynamics operating within them can lead to social change.

What I'd like to do this morning is focus on one particular rhetorical strategy used in the formation of social issues - drawing on these cognate approaches to information literacy - to illustrate how we might expand our concept of the evaluation of sources. My argument is that, without considering the creation, transmission, and reception of messages - and the politics

involved in those processes - we are leaving out a critical piece of what it takes to be information literate.

#### Gaining market share in the marketplace of anxieties

Anxiety is a potent lever for influencing public opinion. Defining social issues often begins with a naming a situation that is believed to be a challenge to commonly-held moral values. Various claims-makers associate their agendas with that threatening condition so they can gain support. In the process, issues are typified through dramatic story-telling, and the domain of concern is expanded to include as many potential victims as possible. Cultural conventions, such as melodrama, are used to give stories emotional punch. In the process, the threat is often distorted to enhance its significance. As James Kincaid has said, "Doing away with demons is only one part of the job; the other is providing them" (74).

Joel Best suggests there are four key players in the formation of social issues: the *media* who seek compelling stories to tell, *activists* who want to promote their solution to the crisis, *governments* that can use issues to gain support for regulating behavior, and *experts*, such as scholars who want their work to have influence. To this list, Mary DeYoung adds *audiences*. For an issue to take off, it must resonate with people's lived experience so their attention can be recruited and retained even after the "facts" have been challenged.

#### **Anxiety about crime**

Lets take crime as an example. Everyone fears crime, yet crime stories are immensely popular. One study of Canadian news outlets found that over half of all news coverage was focused on crime, law, and justice (Erickson et al). They conclude that news helps us "visualize deviance, negotiate control, and represent order" (358). As Val McDermid, a popular author of crime fiction, has pointed out, "certain kinds of fear are actually pleasurable. Adrenaline is, after all, a fabulous drug. It produces a great high, it's legal and it's free." She adds it's also "a very good tool for avoidance of responsibility and deflecting criticism." Or, as James Kincaid has put it, "The idea is not to erase the anxiety but to excite it, since it's the anxiety itself that's doing so much for us" (168). Beyond its entertainment value, crime stories offer a clear-cut depiction of good and evil, deviance and control. With crime, in fiction and in news stories, there's always the possibility of punishment. We can enjoy the thrill while being reassured order can be restored.

Our fascination with crime is nothing new. The bloody stages of Elizabethan theatre were influenced by popular pamphlets recounting true crime for an audience thirsty for reading material. Thomas Dekker and Ben Jonson's 1599 tragedy, *Page of Plymouth* was apparently based on a "true" crime recounted in *Sundry Strange and Inhumaine Murthers* (1591).

The entertainment value of criminal capers came to the forefront after the moralistic Elizabethan age and influenced early English novels. For example, the exploits of James Hind, a criminal, were presented as "A Pill to purge Melancholy," picaresque adventures similar to novels recounting criminal adventures of characters such as Moll Flanders. The artist William Hogarth depicted the dangers of drinking in his pedantic etching, "Gin Lane,"

saying "As the Subjects of these Prints are calculated to reform some reigning Vices peculiar to the lower Class of People, in hopes to render them of the most extensive use, the Author has publish'd them in the cheapest Manner possible." Indeed, in the year the popular print was circulated, Parliament passed the Gin Act that regulated the distribution of gin.

Uncle Tom's Cabin, a novel about the evils of slavery, was an international bestseller, but the book that had held that title previously was <u>The Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk</u>, or <u>The Hidden Secrets of a Nun's Life in a Convent</u>, <u>Exposed!</u> - the purported memoir of a nun who allegedly escaped from an <u>evil Canadian convent</u> and lived to tell the tale - a form of "true crime" so lurid and salacious it was sold in adult bookshops in the 1930s.

Penny dreadfuls, <u>dime novels</u>, and later pulp fiction also drew on the popularity of deviance and criminal behavior. <u>Teen Age Dope Slaves</u>, a comic book on the dangers of drug addiction was considered "deplorable" by the author of <u>Seduction of the Innocent</u>, an influential expose of the dangers of reading comics.

Throughout the history of anxiety-as-entertainment, the line between authenticity and fiction has been deliberately blurred. Fiction borrows fact to make its inventions more plausible; "true crime" borrows the conventions of fiction to make its stories more evocative.

#### **Making monsters**

In 1981 *Time* magazine had a <u>cover story</u> on violent crime, a curse with its very own mummy. The monstrous and inhuman figure made of scrap metal and trash personified the threat of random violence. In fact, there was nothing random about it. The victims of violent crime in the eighties were disproportionately young black men, but in order to name violent crime as an issue of importance, it had to be a threat to white, middle-class readers. Randomness also absolved us of any culpability. There is no messiness about socio-economic factors that might contribute to crime. Since crime had no causes, we could redirect funding of social programs to law enforcement. Forget the war on poverty, let's declare war on crime. During the nineties as violent crime rates fell, our level of concern rose - and so did spending on prisons and law enforcement.

It was also in 1981 that a new phrase entered the language. "Serial killers" were nothing new, but their distinctiveness as a named category and the alleged scale of the problem made it into a crisis. The U.S. Department of Justice announced that serial homicide had jumped from less than one percent of murders to 25% practically overnight. It turned out they simply counted every murder for which the circumstances were unknown at the time police filed reports with the FBI and declared them the work of serial killers. This was convenient, because focusing on killers who were described (inaccurately, as it turns out) as exclusively white males made it easier during a Republican administration for liberals and feminists to support restoring the powers that had been curtailed after the FBI's unconstitutional domestic counterintelligence programs had been exposed a few years earlier. It also made it easier to argue for the restoration of capital punishment, which had been ruled unconstitutional because it was discriminatory. Though the feds later retracted those figures, they still surface from time to time. The narrative of serial murder is more compelling than the average murder.

And, like other crime stories, the boundaries between "true" serial killer stories and the fictional version are fuzzy. When *Sixty Minutes* did a story on profilers, they illustrated the process using clips from *The Silence of the Lambs*.

Children are particularly valuable in the marketplace of anxieties. In 1995 another *Time* cover story focused on <u>cyberporn</u>. A young child was highlighted on the cover, since threatened children will trump free speech every time. Children represent innocence, a nostalgic view of what should be, always under threat from the outside world. As with the threat of random violence and the serial killer, our fears rarely jive with actual risk. The vast majority of child abuse cases are ones of neglect, with physical abuse coming in second, but child sexual abuse has become our major concern in spite of its smaller numbers. We fear strangers harming our children, when in fact families are more dangerous. Over 90% of young children who are homicide victims are killed by parents, relatives or close family friends. Agendasetters have a stake in children being at risk. When a meta-analysis of psychology studies concluded that some older teens who engaged in sex with adults were not permanently damaged by the experience, the authors were condemned by the US Congress. That threat was required so they could defend moral order.

To sum up, anxiety about crime reflects the rhetorical nature of the formation of social issues. When homicide figures went up, people were naturally anxious and wondered if it indicated a seismic shift in our moral climate. Violence was inaccurately characterized as "random," expanding the domain of victims to include everybody. When the FBI wanted more funding and more authority, they discovered the threat of serial killers, artificially raising the numbers to attract concern and support. Whenever an issue needs a boost, bringing children into it is likely to help. The political nature of issue formation, and the role of various players in its creation, transmission, and reception suggests that simply evaluating sources, one by one, using a checklist of surface criteria, risks missing the point (Meola).

The remainder of this workshop will involve participants in working through case studies on the formation of several social issues, ending with a discussion of how instruction librarians might include a more contextualized process of source evaluation as part of our information literacy efforts.

#### Case Study: Crack Babies

- 1. As a group, discuss what you know about this topic (if anything) before turning the page. Note some points made in the discussion. What questions do you still have?
- 2. Examine the citations and excerpts or abstracts attached. Do you have any new information to add to what you already knew? Are there some surprises?
- 4. Who are some of the apparent claims-makers in the formation of this social issue; what groups might benefit from it being defined as an important issue and how? Who might have an interest in discrediting the concept?

5. A loaded question: Some of the excerpts attached are from scholarly sources and others are from the popular press or the Web. If students were told to use only scholarly sources, would that mean they would be limiting their search to sources that were reliable and based entirely on objective research? Why or why not?

#### Citations and Excerpts

#### Cheryl Sullivan. "US Health-Care Crisis in the Making." *Christian Science Monitor* 15 Feb. 1989: 1.

Staggering numbers of drug-addicted infants - born in tandem with the rise of cheap, accessible crack cocaine - are causing a crisis in hospital nurseries across the country. But even as physicians strive to help these babies, they warn that America's struggle to care for these children is only beginning. . . .

Experts say the children are likely to need costly services - from postnatal intensive care at a hospital to special-education programs in school. While much more research on the problem needs to be done, one thing is clear: The existing medical and social-service system is likely to be overwhelmed by the surging numbers of crack babies.

### Chasnoff, D.E. Lewis, D.R. Girffith, and S. Wiley. "Cocaine and Pregnancy: Clinical and Toxicological Implications for the Neonate." *Clin Chem* 35 (1989): 1276-8.

Abstract: Recent studies show that the rate of cocaine use by pregnant women in the United States is much higher than realized hitherto, and an increasing number of infants are being born to cocaine-using mothers. In an ongoing research project to study the effects of cocaine on pregnancy outcome, we studied 70 infants born to cocaine-using women. . . . Cocaine-exposed infants had lower birth weight, shorter gestation, and a smaller head circumference than control infants. Cocaine-exposed infants also had neurobehavioral abnormalities at initial evaluation and a higher rate of perinatal complications. . . .

### Susan Chira. "Children of Crack: Are the Schools Ready? A Special Report: Crack Babies Turn 5 and Schools Brace." *The New York Times* 25 May 1990: A1.

The nation's inner-city schools, already strained by the collapse of families and the wounds of poverty, will face another onslaught this fall -the first big wave of children prenatally exposed to crack.

With the use of crack having reached epidemic proportions in the mid-1980's, the children born to pregnant users then are now turning 5 and will enter kindergarten in the fall. Researchers agree these children's neurological, emotional and learning problems will severely test teachers and schools, and many fear this is a test schools are doomed to fail. . . .

Dr. Judy Howard, professor of clinical pediatrics at the University of California at Los Angeles's medical school, is a leading researcher on cocaine-exposed babies. He predicts that in some inner-city schools such children will make up 40 percent to 60 percent of

classrooms within a few years. The March of Dimes says the number of crack-exposed children by the year 2000 could range from half a million to four million.

#### Katharine Greider. "Crackpot Ideas." Mother Jones. 7 July/Aug. 1995: 52.

DURING THE LATE '80S, AMERICANS SHOOK THEIR heads in disgust at reports that poor black mothers were sacrificing the little ones resting in their wombs for the pleasures of crack cocaine, callously dooming a new generation to "a life of certain suffering, of probable deviance, of permanent inferiority," to quote columnist Charles Krauthammer.

Seizing on early studies that raised alarm over fetal damage from cocaine, scientists cited the same inconclusive data again and again. Local news organs spun their own versions of the crack-baby story, taking for granted the accuracy of its premise. Social workers, foster parents, doctors, teachers, and journalists put forward unsettling anecdotes about the "crack babies" they had seen . . . Reporters went into hospital nurseries and special schools and borrowed the images of premature babies or bawling African-American preschoolers to illustrate their crack-baby stories. Carol Cole, who taught at the Salvin Special Education School in Los Angeles, remembers reporters asking if they could get pictures of the children trembling. . . .

Thirteen states require doctors to report drug use in pregnancy or positive drug tests in newborns. Nine states specifically define drug use during pregnancy as child abuse or neglect, triggering a range of responses from treatment and other services to an investigation and the possible removal of the child. The bulk of these policies were put in place between 1988 and 1991, as the crack-baby scare peaked.

### J. Litt and M. McNeil. "Biological Markers and Social Differentiation: Crack Babies and the Construction of the Dangerous Mother." *Health Care Women Int.* 18 (1997): 31-41.

Abstract: Crack mothers - particularly African American and Latina women - have been constructed as maternal villains who actively and permanently damage their offspring. Many women have been arrested or lost parental rights to their children because of child neglect charges. Despite this panic, recent medical and legal research indicates that reports of damage to the fetus have been greatly exaggerated. This article examines the ongoing questions in medical publications about crack babies. The authors connect the search for biological markers of cocaine use during pregnancy to a new cultural conception of a biounderclass. The conclusion considers medical developments and controversies in the broader context of class and racial divisions and reproductive politics in the United States.

### Christopher S. Wren. "For Crack Babies, a Future Less Bleak." *New York Times* 22 Sept. 1998: D4.

When the first babies were born to crack addicts in the mid-1980's, images of trembling infants with tubes up their noses led to fears that such children were irreversibly damaged and doomed to grow into violent misfits.

The dire predictions failed to materialize by the early 1990's, prompting a different conclusion: that cocaine causes no lingering effects on children born to drug-addicted mothers. Instead, it

was asserted, whatever problems the children had could be attributed to poverty and other environmental factors.

Now many pediatricians and other child development specialists who work with these children believe that the complex truth lies in between. . . .

### Office of National Drug Control Policy. "Cocaine." ONDCP Drug Policy Information Clearinghouse Fact Sheet Nov. 2003. (retrieved 20 Dec. 2004).

... Although the effects of prenatal cocaine exposure are not completely understood, scientific studies have shown that such afflicted babies are often born prematurely, have low birth weights and smaller head circumferences, and are shorter in length. Originally thought to suffer irreversible neurological damage, these "crack babies" now appear to recover from the drug exposure. This is not to underestimate the many subtle but significant effects such babies later experience because of their exposure to cocaine, including impairment in behaviors that are crucial to concentrating in school. . . .

#### Ken Kobré. Crack Babies in Infancy. (photostory) (retrieved 20 Dec. 2004).

. . . [caption for a photograph of a crying infant] Exposed to the drug in the womb and born addicted to crack cocaine, this child experiences severe withdrawal symptoms. Conservative estimates suggest that at least 11 percent of all newborns in the United States today were exposed in the womb to one or more illicit drugs. The number is even higher in urban areas. Birth and hospitalization of a normal newborn cost approximately \$2,000. Birth and hospital care of a crack exposed neonate, with round-the-clock nursing, monitors, blood and urine tests, high-tech equipment and social service evaluations, costs \$11,000. Who pays the bill? The government, since crack-addicted mothers are unlikely to carry insurance. . . . [though there is no date on this page, the rood directory is for an Elsevier-owned publisher of books on media technology, dated 2004.]

### L. T. Singer et al. "Cognitive Outcomes of Preschool Children with Prenatal Cocaine Exposure." *JAMA* 292 (2004): 1021.

Abstract: CONTEXT: Because of methodological limitations, the results of the few prospective studies assessing long-term cognitive effects of prenatal cocaine exposure are inconsistent. OBJECTIVE: To assess effects of prenatal cocaine exposure and quality of caregiving environment on 4-year cognitive outcomes. . . . Prenatal cocaine exposure was not associated with lower full-scale, verbal, or performance IQ scores but was associated with an increased risk for specific cognitive impairments and lower likelihood of IQ above the normative mean at 4 years. A better home environment was associated with IQ scores for cocaine-exposed children that are similar to scores in nonexposed children.

#### **Case Study: Cycle of Violence**

1. This phrase is used in many contexts; here, we're focusing on the notion of intergenerational violence - that children who grow up in abusive situations are likely to become abusers. As a group, discuss what you know about this concept (if anything) before turning the page. Note some points made in the discussion. What questions do you still have?

- 2. Examine the citations and excerpts or abstracts attached. Do you have any new information to add to what you already knew? Are there some surprises?
- 3. As you examined each citation, what "markers" helped you decide whether a source would be useful for understanding this issue or not? Make a list of markers you used to evaluate each source. Which are the most difficult of these markers for non-specialists to understand and apply?
- 4. Who are some of the apparent claims-makers in the formation of this social issue; that is, what groups might benefit from it being defined as an important issue and how? Who might have an interest in discrediting the concept?
- 5. A loaded question: Some of the excerpts attached are from scholarly sources and others are from the popular press or the Web. If students were told to use only scholarly sources, would that mean they would be limiting their search to sources that were reliable and based entirely on objective research? Why or why not?

#### Citations and Excerpts

Larry B. Silver, Christina C. Dublin, and Reginal S. Lourie. "Does Violence Breed Violence? Contributions from a study of the child abuse syndrome." *American Journal of Psychiatry* 126 (1969): 404-407.

Abstract: A study covering 3 generations of families of abused children supports the themes that violence breeds violence and that a child who experiences violence as a child has the potential of becoming a violent member of society in the future. It is believed that the physician has a critical role and responsibility in interruption this cycle of violence.

### Srinika Jayartne. "Child Abusers as Parents and Children: A Review." Social Work 22 (1977): 5-9.

. . . The generational phenomenon of child abuse is one of the commonly held conceptions (or misconceptions) about abusing parents. The essence of this proposition is that the victim of abuse incorporates patterns of aggression, which are then repeated from generation to generation . . . The literature is spotted with definitional confusion, poor methodology, clinical assumptions, and a definite "Rosenthal Effect" - that is, fulfilling a prior expectation of the research. . . . The available data on the generational hypothesis do not stand the test of empiricism.

#### Winter, Leon. "P.G. to Study Further Aid to Victims of Abuse." *Washington Post* 27 Jan. 1984: B5.

Prince George's County Executive Parris Glendening, calling domestic violence a serious problem in the county, announced yesterday the appointment of a task force headed by

former county police chief John Rhodes to study ways to improve county services to battered spouses and children.

"The goal is to stop the cycle of domestic violence that rolls on and on from generation to generation," Glendening said, citing a recent spate of violent cases in the county involving child or spouse abuse.

#### A.H. Green. "Child Maltreatment and its Victims: A Comparison of Physical and Sexual Abuse." *Psychiatr Clin North Am* 11 (1988): 591-610.

Abstract: Although physical and sexual abuse are separate and distinct types of victimization, their impact on children is quite similar. . . . Perhaps the most striking similarity between physical and sexual abuse of children is the tendency of the children to re-enact and recreate their victimization with others, leading to a transmission of violence in the next generation. Like their parents who were frequently victimized during childhood, they repeat and perpetuate an "aggressor-victim" interaction in their subsequent relationships. Both physical and sexual abuse are embedded in a deviant family structure, which adds to the psychopathology of the children. . . .

### Ronald L. Simons et al. "Intergenerational Transmission of Harsh Parenting." *Developmental Psychology* 27 (1991): 159-171.

Abstract: A social learning model was developed that portrayed 4 processes whereby harsh parenting might be transmitted across generations. The model was tested using a sample of 451 2-parent families, each of which included a 7th grader. Both parent self-report and adolescent-report measures were utilized for the harsh parenting construct. Analysis using structural equation modeling procedures showed that grandparents who had engaged in aggressive parenting produced presentday parents who were likely to use similar parenting practices. The effect was stronger for mothers than for fathers. In addition to a direct modeling effect, there was evidence that similarities across generations regarding the harsh discipline of male children are in part a function of socioeconomic characteristics being transmitted across generations. There was little support for the contention that parents transmit their aggressive parenting practices indirectly by influencing the personality and parenting beliefs of their children.

# U.S. General Accounting Office. Report to the Chairman, Subcommittee on Crime, Committee on the Judiciary, House of Representatives: Cycle of Sexual Abuse - Research Inconclusive About Whether Child Victims Become Adult Abusers. Washington DC: GAO, 1996.

This report summarizes the results of, and discusses the methodologies used in, the studies that have been done on the cycle of sexual abuse—that is, on the likelihood that individuals who were victims of sexual abuse as children will become sexual abusers of children in adulthood. . . .

. . . the experience of childhood sexual victimization is quite likely neither a necessary nor a sufficient cause of adult sexual offending. The two prospective studies concluded that the majority of victims of sexual abuse during childhood did not become sex offenders as adults.

Therefore, childhood sexual victimization would not necessarily lead to adult sexual offending. In addition, the majority of retrospective studies concluded that most adult sex offenders against children did not report that they were sexually victimized as children.

#### Cathy Spatz Widom. "Child Abuse and Neglect." Encyclopedia of Criminology and Deviant Behavior Philadelphia: Brunner-Routledge, 2001: vol. 1, 40-42.

Another pervasive assumption is that those who are victimized in childhood are more likely to become perpetrators of violence when they grow up. There is evidence to support this notion that 'violence begets violence' . . . [but] These 'cycle of violence' findings illustrate a related important point--the cycle of violence is not deterministic or inevitable. Childhood physical abuse and neglect put one at increased risk for being arrested for a violent crime, but the path between these two points in time is far from direct or inevitable.

### Ruth-Ellen M. Grimes. "Child Sexual Abuse" *Encyclopedia of Criminology and Deviant Behavior.* Philadelphia: Brunner-Routledge, 2001: vol. 3, p 54-61.

". . . contrary to another popular myth, the clear majority of CSA (child sexual abuse) perpetrators are not victims of prior abuse."

#### Dennis Lehane. Mystic River. New York: William Morrow, 2001.

[a novel in which one character, abducted and sexually assaulted as a child, is suspected of murder in adulthood] Whenever Dave was uncertain of a situation, whenever the ground seemed to be shifting and slick under his feet, his brain tended to split into two halves, as if cleaved by a carving knife. This gave him a headache and occasionally something worse.

Because sometimes Dave was not Dave. He was The Boy, The Boy Who'd Escaped from Wolves . . . an animal of the dusk that moved through wooded landscapes, silent and invisible. It lived in a world that others never saw, never faced, never knew or wanted to know existed . . . And the Boy had not grown up well. He'd gotten angrier, more paranoid, capable of things the real Dave could never so much as imagine. . . .

It would be so easy . . . to just give in. Give in to what he'd been feeling for the last decade at least. . . .

But (and this is where Dave's brain always split in half) he knew deep in his soul that this would be the worst sin of all. He knew it would be crossing a line - no matter how inviting - from which he could never come back. He knew that if he crossed that line he'd never feel whole, that he might has well have stayed in that basement with Henry and George [his assailants] for the rest of his life.

#### A. Caspi et al. "Role of Genotype in the Cycle of Violence in Maltreated Children." *Science* 297 (2002): 851-4.

Abstract: We studied a large sample of male children from birth to adulthood to determine why some children who are maltreated grow up to develop antisocial behavior, whereas others do not. A functional polymorphism in the gene encoding the neurotransmittermetabolizing enzyme monoamine oxidase A (MAOA) was found to moderate the effect of maltreatment. Maltreated children with a genotype conferring high levels of MAOA expression

were less likely to develop antisocial problems. These findings may partly explain why not all victims of maltreatment grow up to victimize others, and they provide epidemiological evidence that genotypes can moderate children's sensitivity to environmental insults.

United States Department of Health and Human Services. <u>HHS Launches Effort to Help Children Who Witness Domestic Violence</u>. 8 Oct. 2003. (retrieved 20 Dec. 2004). HHS Secretary Tommy G. Thompson today announced a new initiative to help children who witness domestic violence to develop into healthy, well-adjusted adults and prevent the cycle of violence from continuing from one generation to the next.

The initiative, called "Safe and Bright Futures for Children," will incorporate evidence-based practices such as treatment for child and adolescent trauma, mentoring and mental health services while also addressing risk and protective factors to negate the cyclical effects of violence. It will encourage the integration of these services at the local and regional level by building collaborations of community, faith-based or other programs that identify, assess, treat and provide long-term services. . . .

### Tim Robbins. "Acceptance Speech [for his role in the film version of *Mystic River*]" Ocsar.com 29 Feb 2004. (retrieved 21 Dec. 2004).

In this movie, I play a victim of abuse and violence and if you are out there and are a person that has -- had that tragedy befall you, there is no shame and no weakness in seeking help and counseling it is sometimes the strongest thing that you can do to stop the cycle of violence. Thank you."

#### Case Study: Plagiarism

- 1. Cheating, plagiarism, and academic dishonesty are receiving much attention lately. As a group, discuss what you know about this issue before turning the page. Why is it so prominent an issue today? Note some points made in the discussion. What questions do you still have?
- 2. Examine the citations and excerpts or abstracts attached. Do you have any new information to add to what you already knew? Are there some surprises?
- 3. As you examined each citation, what "markers" helped you decide whether a source would be useful for understanding this issue or not? Make a list of markers you used to evaluate each source. Which are the most difficult of these markers for non-specialists to understand and apply?
- 4. Who are some of the apparent claims-makers in the formation of this social issue; that is, what groups might benefit from it being defined as an important issue and how? Who might have an interest in discrediting the concept?

5. A loaded question: Some of the excerpts attached are from scholarly sources and others are from the popular press or the Web. If students were told to use only scholarly sources, would that mean they would be limiting their search to sources that were reliable and based entirely on objective research? Why or why not?

#### Citations and Excerpts

#### Susan Lawrence. "Watching the Watchers." Science News 119 (1981): 3+.

. . . Although virtually all scientists agree that data falsification and plagiarism are cardinal sins in research, opinions differ on how common they are and on what their causes may be. Furthermore, no one seems quite sure how they can be detected or prevented without damaging an already stressed research system . . . Ironically enough, the one point virtually everyone discussing the issue agrees on is that there are no data on the incidence of fakery in scientific research. That lack of data makes it difficult for the scientific world to offer an effective response . . .

#### Anthony DePalma. "Plagiarism Seen by Scholars in King's Ph.D. Dissertation" *New York Times* 11 Oct 1990: A1.

Torn between loyalty to his subject and to his discipline, the editor of the papers of the Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. reluctantly acknowledged yesterday that substantial parts of Dr. King's doctoral dissertation and other academic papers from his student years appeared to have been plagiarized. . . .

"By the strictest definition of plagiarism -- that is, any appropriation of words or ideas -- there are instances of plagiarism in these papers." . . .

### "Becoming Martin Luther King, Jr.: An Introduction." *Journal of American History* 78 (1991): 11-22.

... Instead of viewing this news as an opportunity to probe how and why a great American used language in this way at this time and place, most commentators worried instead about how much King's plagiarism diminished his greatness and heroism. In reading many of these accounts, I find it hard to escape the conclusion that commentators were simply trying to decide how many points they should subtract from King's greatness score. . . .

The language that King knew best, as Keith Miller shows in the accompanying essay, was the oral language of the African-American pulpit. Even when he crossed borders into other worlds, King envisioned interaction between speaker and audience in ways he had learned from the folk pulpit. In this oral tradition, repetition was highly valued because it assured that knowledge would be remembered. . . .

#### Philip J. Hilts. "Plagiarists Take Note: Machine's On Guard." *New York Times* 7 Jan. 1992: C1.

Few figures in science have engendered more emotion than Walter Stewart and Dr. Ned Feder -- and that was before they invented their little "plagiarism machine."

"You put the papers in here," Mr. Stewart said as he bent forward and peered through thick glasses bound to his head by a rubber band. The scanner digests the paper, transforming it into a computer file ready for the test.

... "I find it chilling," said Dr. Maxine Singer, president of the Carnegie Institution, a research organization in Washington. "We don't normally in our society go looking for behavior not consistent with accepted practices. The whole system is designed to protect people. I don't know why in science we have to do these more threatening kinds of things."

Mr. Stewart and Dr. Feder "may be well-intentioned," Dr. Singer said, but she does not make the same allowance for their machine. "Of the various uses modern technology would be put to, this machine is one we didn't expect. We would have expected the C.I.A. or Interpol to use it, not scientists."

### Rebecca Moore Howard. "Plagiarisms, Authorships, and the Academic Death Penalty." *College English* 57 (1995): 788-806.

... Hypertext makes visible what literary critics have theorized: the cumulative, interactive nature of writing that makes impossible the representation of a stable category of authorship and hence a stable category of plagiarism. . . . The Internet user surfs through a universe of information, stumbling quite by accident upon all sorts of materials without knowing quite how he or she got there or how to get home again. Citing data from such sources can pose near-impossible challenges for the writer. And when any of these phenomena occur in hypertext, with its multiple authors whose contributions are untraceable, the matter becomes hopelessly entangled.

### <u>Turnitin.com</u> [home page] 18 October 2001. Found through the Internet Archive *Wayback Machine* (retrieved 23 Dec. 2004).

This is the new website for Turnitin.com, the world's leading intellectual property protection service for education. Our service is designed to assist both educators and students concerned with the growing problem of Internet plagiarism. Turnitin.com has proven itself, both in independent comparison tests and through successful implementation in academic institutions across the globe, to be the only reliable means of tracking student misuse of intellectual property on the Web.

### Nick Carbone. "<u>Turnitin.com</u>, a <u>Pedagogic Placebo for Plagairism</u>." *Bedford/St. Martin's Technotes*. 5 June 2001. (retrieved 23 Dec. 2004).

... Turnitin.com keeps a copy of every paper submitted and adds it to their database. Students have no choice in the matter; if a professor submits a student's paper for a check, it's archived -- essentially inhouse-published -- for future use by the Turnitin.com database. The Turnitin.com privacy policy and user agreement say nothing on this that I could find. And that in itself is problematic in my view. . . .

With Turnitin.com, students' work is captured and held without their permission. This goes against the grain of most writing pedagogy, which premises that students are 'authors' and 'authorities' and owners of their own work (coincidentally, the assumption used to establish copyright). It also goes against the grain of one's right to their intellectual property that

Turnitin.com, in its pursuit of plagiarists, seeks to uphold. So using Turnitin.com presents students with a double standard.

### David D. Kirkpatrick. "As Historian's Fame Grows, So Do Questions on Methods." *New York Times* 11 January 2002: A1.

.... Mr. Ambrose borrowed words, phrases and passages from other historians' books. . . .

But even while conceding mistakes, Mr. Ambrose also defended his overall methods. He noted that in each case he included a footnote to the works he used, and he sometimes praised the books in his text.

"I tell stories," Mr. Ambrose said. "I don't discuss my documents. I discuss the story. It almost gets to the point where, how much is the reader going to take? I am not writing a Ph.D. dissertation."

"I wish I had put the quotation marks in, but I didn't," Mr. Ambrose said. "I am not out there stealing other people's writings. If I am writing up a passage and it is a story I went to tell and this story fits and a part of it is from other people's writing, I just type it up that way and put it in a footnote."

### Ariana Eunjung Cha. "Harry Potter and the Copyright Lawyer; Use of Popular Characters Puts 'Fan Fiction' Writers in Gray Area." *Washington Post* 18 June 2003: A1.

. . . In the past few years, a curious literary genre known as "fan fiction" has been flourishing. The term refers to all manner of vignettes, short stories and novels based on the universes described in popular books, TV shows and movies. Similarly derived works are appearing in music, where fans are using their computers to mix songs from popular artists into new works that they call "mashups." Movie fans are taking digital copies of films such as the "Star Wars" epics and creating alternate endings or deleting characters such as the much-maligned Jar Jar Binks.

The explosion of these part-original, part-borrowed works has set authors of fan fiction against some media companies in a battle to redefine the line between consumers' right to "fair use" and copyright holders' rights to control their intellectual property. . . .

### "<u>A Cheating Crisis in America's Schools</u> [transcript]." *Primetime Live* ABC News. 29 April 2004 (retrieved 23 Dec, 2004).

... Lifting papers off the Internet is one of the newer trends in plagiarism - and technology is giving students even more ways to cheat nowadays.

Authoritative numbers are hard to come by, but according to a 2002 confidential survey of 12,000 high school students, 74 percent admitted cheating on an examination at least once in the past year.

In a six-month investigation, Primetime traveled to colleges and high schools across the country to see how students are cheating, and why. The bottom line is not just that many students have more temptation - but they seem to have a whole new mindset. . . .

Fortunately, educators have technological options too. Schools have been subscribing to a service called Turnitin.com, which can help teachers compare students' papers to all the available literature in its database.

"It's typically 30 percent of all the papers submitted have significant levels of plagiarism," said John Barrie, founder of Turnitin.com.

#### Turnitin.com [home page] 2004 (retrieved 24 Dec. 2004).

What if the Internet could help students take more responsibility for learning and let teachers focus on teaching? Now it can. Recognized worldwide as the standard in online plagiarism prevention, Turnitin helps educators and students take full advantage of the Internet's educational potential.

#### **Case Study: The Doubling of Information**

1. We all seem awash in too much information to the point it has become a matter of concern
- it has exploded, we're drowning in it. As a group, discuss what you know about this concept
(if anything) before turning the page. Note some points made in the discussion. What
questions do vou still have?

2. Examine the citations and excerpts or abstracts attached. Do you have any new information to add to what you already knew? Are there some surprises?

3. As you examined each citation, what "markers" helped you decide whether a source would be useful for understanding this issue or not? Make a list of markers you used to evaluate each source. Which are the most difficult of these markers for non-specialists to understand and apply?

4. Who are some of the apparent claims-makers in the formation of this social issue; that is, who might benefit from anxiety about the information explosion?
5. The final selection in this set of excerpts says many of the original publications about the growth of information present no evidence to back up their claims, yet some of those sources

have been quoted repeatedly. How can we help students question claims that appear to be

#### Citations and Excerpts

Richard Saul Wurman. Information Anxiety. New York: Doubleday, 1989: 32.

"documented" when the source they are drawn from is faulty?

A weekday edition of the *New York Times* contains more information than the average person was likely to come across in a lifetime in seventeenth-century England. . . . [no evidence is provided for this claim - it's simply stated as fact.]

Todd Oppenheimer. "Reality Bytes: We Listen in on the New-Media Moguls - and They're Nervous." *Columbia Journalism Review* 35.3 (Sept.-Oct. 1996): 40+.

[Quoting Barry Diller]. . . "Archivists estimate that the collective sum of all printed knowledge is doubling every four years. More information has been produced in the last thirty years than in the previous five thousand," he said. "And it's only getting faster and more out of control.

David Shenk. *Data Smog*. Rev. and updated ed. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1998: 30.

With information production not only increasing, but accelerating, there is no sign that processing will ever catch up. We have quite suddenly mutated into a radically different culture, a civilization that trades in and survives on stylized communication . . .

How much information in our midst is useful, and how much of it gets in the way? What is our signal to noise ration?

We know that the ratio has diminished of late, and that the character of information has changed: As we accrue more and more of it, information has emerged not only as a currency, but also as a pollutant.

### William J. Clinton. <u>Remarks by the President to the National Association of Attorneys</u> <u>General</u>. March 12, 1998. (retrieved 23 Dec. 2004).

The sheer volume of knowledge is doubling every five years now. We are literally, because of human genome research we are literally solving problems in a matter of days that took years to solve not long before I took office. The worldwide web is growing by something like 65,000 web sites an hour now. When I took office, there were 50—(laughter)—50. Think about that. Just a little over five years ago the web was the province of a handful of scientists, physicists, started by a government research project in the Defense Department. The government, quite properly, having done the basic research and getting it up and going, got out of the way, and now it's the fastest growing organ of human interaction ever, in all of human history.

National Forum on Information Literacy. <u>A Progress Report on Information Literacy - An Update on the American Library Association Presidential Committee on Information Literacy: Final Report</u>. March 1998 (retrieved 24 Dec. 2004).

The workplace of the present and future demands a new kind of worker. In a global marketplace, data is dispatched in picoseconds and gigabits, and this deluge of information must be sorted, evaluated, and applied. When confronted by such an overload of information, most workers today tend to take the first or most easily accessed information--without any concern for the quality of that information. As a result, such poorly trained workers are costing businesses billions of dollars annually in low productivity, accidents, absenteeism, and poor product quality. There is no question about it: for today's and tomorrow's workers, the workplace is going through cataclysmic changes that very few will be prepared to participate in successfully and productively unless they are information literate. . . .

#### Bob Herbert. "Miracles at Warp Speed." New York Times 31 Dec. 1999: A21.

. . . "Science right now is the most powerful single force in our culture. We've got guys who are not just working on the double helix, approaching the structure that carries all of our DNA-based genetic code -- they're saying: 'Well, let's build something beyond that. Let's build our own structures." . . . .

Dr. Crow is helping to develop a project that will bring experts together from a wide variety of disciplines to study the implications--and, where feasible, help shape the outcomes--of scientific and technological research.

Offering an illustration of the astonishing speed of some scientific advances, Dr. Crow said, "Biological science's knowledge is doubling every 180 days."

Katherine S. Mangan. "In Revamped Library Schools, Information Trumps Books: Institutions: Curricula and New Names Reflect Student Interests and the Job Market." Chronicle of Higher Education 7 April 2000: A43. (retrieved 24 Dec. 2004).

... Michigan's School of Information, as it is now known, is part of a trend that is making some librarians shudder in their stacks. Increasingly, library studies are making way for specialties that train students for high-tech careers in which skills at handling and organizing vast amounts of information are in great demand. . . . "The amount of electronic information is doubling every 60 minutes," says John L. King, dean of Michigan's School of Information. . . .

#### **General Comments.** Library of Congress Cataloging Directorate. (retrieved 24 Dec.

**2004).** [This appears to be a transcript of e-mail communications held in connection with the Library of Congress's Bicentennial Conference on Bibliographic Control for the New Millennium, November 15-17, 2000.]

- ... Barbara Baruth [mailto:baruth@UWP.EDU] said:
- >>According to John L. King, Dean of the University of Michigan's School of Information, the amount of electronic information doubles each hour. I'm fearful that even efforts like CORC simply can't scale to that level.<<

David Miller <dmiller@curry.edu> said:

>> Frankly, I'm extremely wary of all such statements, and there have been plenty of them. This kind of bare statistical remark tells us nothing about the nature of this "information," its context or its value. (I'd also like to know if this is based on empirical data and where that comes from, or if it's a rhetorical extrapolation.<<

It is clearly rhetorical exaggeration, unless John L. King is ignorant of the power of exponentiation. If we started this year with just one bit of information (and there was clearly more than that number), then now, about 6,000 hours later, there would be roughly 10 to the power of 1,800 bits of information. That's considerably more than the number of atoms in the universe, so there is not enough physical matter to store that amount of information.

Giles Martin, OCLC Forest Press

### Al Gore. "Our Whole Future Is at Stake." [acceptance speech at Democratic National Convention, 17 August 2000] *Washington Post* 18 August 2000: A30.

At a time when the amount of human knowledge is doubling every five years and science and technology are advancing so rapidly, we will do bold things to make our schools the best in the world. I will fight for the single greatest commitment to education since the G.I. Bill, for revolutionary improvements in our schools, for higher standards and more accountability, to put a fully qualified teacher in every classroom, test all new teachers and give teachers the training and professional development they deserve. It's time to treat and reward teachers like the professionals that they are.

### "<u>Executive Summary</u>." *How Much Information? 2003.* School of Information Management and Systems, U.C. Berkeley. 27 Oct. 2003. (retrieved 23 Dec. 2004).

We estimate that the amount of new information stored on paper, film, magnetic, and optical media has about doubled in the last three years. . . . Summary estimates show that the storage of new information has been growing at a rate of over 30% a year (upper estimate, uncompressed). There has been dramatic growth in storage of new information over the past two years in every storage medium except film. Film-based content - especially photographs – is migrating to digital media, both optical and magnetic.

"Prophecies Concerning the Last Days: Tribulations." Last Day Warriors. 2004. (retrieved 24 Dec. 2004). [A listing of Biblical prophecies with present-day examples] Increase in speed and knowledge -Dan. 12:14

"But as for you, Daniel, conceal these words and seal up the book until the end of time; many will go back and forth, and knowledge will increase."

Knowledge is increasing in quantum leaps especially in the fields of computers and physics. . . .

Martin Raish. "Shining Some Light on the Monster Under the Bed: A Closer Look at the 'Doubling of Knowledge." In *Musings, Meanderings, and Monsters, Too: Essays on Academic Librarianship*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow, 2003: 145-156.

We have all heard the mantra: knowledge is doubling every (insert you favorite number here) . . . I have no doubt that the amount of data is growing at an astounding pace, as we discover more about our natural world and create mountains of "artificial data" in our manmade world. If these statements spoke of "data" instead of "knowledge" or "information" I would have a much smaller quarrel with them. . . .

This review of statements about the growth of information/knowledge has revealed a fundamental confusion about what is being measured, a crucial inability to measure whatever this might be, and a total disregard for seeking documentation instead of repeating undocumented rumors . . . Together, these factors lead me to conclude the "Knowledge is Doubling" monster is, to a large extent, more a mirage than a reality.

#### Case Study: Effect of Violence in the Mass Media

- 1. As a group, discuss what you know about this concept before turning the page. Note some points made in the discussion. What questions do you still have?
- 2. Examine the citations and excerpts or abstracts attached. Do you have any new information to add to what you already knew? Are there some surprises?
- 3. As you examined each citation, what "markers" helped you decide whether a source would be useful for understanding this issue or not? Make a list of markers you used to evaluate each source. Which are the most difficult of these markers for non-specialists to understand and apply?
- 4. Who are some of the apparent claims-makers in the formation of this social issue; that is, what groups might benefit from it being defined as an important issue and how? Who might have an interest in discrediting the concept?
- 5. A loaded question: Some of the excerpts attached are from scholarly sources and others are from the popular press or the Web. If students were told to use only scholarly sources, would that mean they would be limiting their search to sources that were reliable and based entirely on objective research? Why or why not?

#### Citations and Excerpts

### Leonard Berkowitz, Ronald Corwin, and Mark Heironimus. "Film Violence and Subsequent Aggressive Tendencies." *Public Opinion Quarterly* 27 (1963): 217-229.

. . . Rather than providing an easy and safe outlet for the pent-up hostility within the angered members of the media audience, film violence may well increase the probability that someone in the audience will behave aggressively in a later situation (soon afterward) . . .

### F. Scott Andison. "TV Violence and Viewer Aggression: A Cumulation of Study Results 1956-1976." *Public Opinion Quarterly* 41 (1977): 314-331.

The problem posed by television's violent content and its possible effects on regular television viewers is a critical and pressing one. The need to establish whether a causal link exists between television violence and an increased level of aggression in viewers is urgent because, if such a link exists, then action may be needed . . . We can conclude on the basis of the present data cumulation that television, as it is shown today, probably does stimulate a higher amount of aggression in individuals within society.

#### Richard Cohen. "Violence." Washington Post 6 Dec. 1981: B1.

In Milpitas, Calif., a 16-year-old boy allegedly killed his 14-year-old former girlfriend and then for a day or two took friends by to see the body in a nearby ravine. In Maryland, an 18-year-old woman asked her boyfriend and his friends to kill her husband of two months and so they did. Then, like the kids in California, they all went home.

These incidents of teen-age murder are just two examples of a startling and frightening trend -- the increasing willingness of youngsters to kill. What is striking about both incidents is not only that they happened, but that the kids thought nothing of them. They thought that murder was somehow routine or that if it was not routine for them, then it was for others.

Probably no other generation has grown up with as much violence as this one. The violence, though, is not real. It is televised, which means that it is a special kind of violence. It has no consequence. . . .

### D.P. Phillips DP. "The impact of Mass Media Violence on U.S. Homicides." *American Sociological Review* 48 (1983):560 68.

Since 1950 more than 2500 studies have attempted to discover whether mass media violence triggers additional aggressive behavior . . . This paper presents what may be the first systematic evidence suggesting that some homicides are indeed triggered by a type of mass media violence. . . . This paper has presented evidence which suggests that heavyweight prize fights provoke a brief, sharp increase in homicides.

#### S.F. Messner. "Television Violence and Violent Crime: An Aggregate Analysis." *Social Problems* 33 (1986): 218 35.

Abstract: Examined the relationship between levels of exposure to TV violence and rates of violent crime for samples of population aggregates. It was hypothesized that population aggregates with high levels of exposure to violent TV content would exhibit high rates of

criminal violence. Results fail to support this hypothesis. Contrary to expectations, aggregate levels of exposure to TV were inversely related to rates of violent crime.

David Walsh et al. *Physician Guide to Media Violence*. American Medical Association. 1996. (retrieved 27 Dec. 2004).

The United States is correctly viewed as being among the most violent countries. For example, US homicide rates far exceed those in any other industrialized country and are in fact two to three times as high as those of the second-highest ranking nation. . . . The multiple causes of violence notwithstanding, depictions of violence in the media have unequivocal effects. There are significant correlations between frequent exposure to television violence and aggressive behavior, and the evidence strongly supports the idea that the latter is a consequence of the former. . . .

#### Lawrie Mifflin. "Many Researchers Say Link Is Already Clear on Media and Youth Violence." *New York Times* 9 May 1999: A27.

In response to the Colorado school shooting, President Clinton is to meet with entertainment industry executives and others at the White House tomorrow to discuss youth violence. And both the White House and Congress are considering asking the Surgeon General to conduct a comprehensive study of the effects of media violence on American youths.

But most academic researchers say they believe that the evidence is already at the President's and the Surgeon General's fingertips. Hundreds of studies done at the nation's top universities in the last three decades have come to the same conclusion: that there is at least some demonstrable link between watching violent acts in movies or television shows and acting aggressively in life. . . .

Gloria Tristani. Wrestling for Our Children's Future: Remarks of FCC Commissioner Gloria Tristani Before the Conference on Television Violence of Puerto Rico. 12 Oct. 1999. (retrieved 24 Dec. 2004).

... The statistics are chilling. According to the Department of Justice, 19% of all arrests in 1997 were juveniles, including 14% of all murder arrests and 17% of all violent crime arrests. Just as alarming, the Center for Disease Control and Prevention reports that 5.9% of high school students carried a gun in the 30 days prior to the survey, and 8.5% of them carry some sort of weapon to school. . . .

I'd like to talk with you today about one contributing factor to the youth violence that's afflicting our nation - violence on television. Again, I'm not saying that violence on TV is the main problem, or that we should ignore other root causes. But while TV violence is not the whole problem, I do believe it is part of the problem. The more risk factors we can reduce for our children, the fewer situations that will boil over into violence.

Violence on TV has become so prevalent, we've all become a bit numb. Children are exposed to 8,000 murders and 100,000 acts of violence on TV by the time they complete elementary school. . . .

#### Richard Rhodes. "The Media-Violence Myth." Rolling Stone 23 Nov. 2000: 55+.

SO ALL THE ELDERS ONCE AGAIN AGREE: WATCHING mock violence in the media leads to violent behavior. In Senate hearings in September, assorted senators and candidates condemned Hollywood for marketing violent movies to children. The politicians relied on such illustrious authorities as the American Medical Association, the American Psychological Association and even the FBI. "Thousands of studies" prove it. There's a "national consensus." If "violent" media don't turn little Johnny into a killer, the elders say, he's still likely to become "desensitized" to violence, or he'll acquire a fearful conviction that it's a "mean world." Are any of these claims true?

In a word, they're baloney. . . .

## Sara Bragg. "Just What the Doctors Ordered? Media Regulation, Education, and the 'Problem' of Media Violence." In *III Effects: The Media/Violence Debate* 2nd ed. London: Routledge, 2001: 87-110.

[Critiquing two media education projects] We should certainly question how far these projects are a response to a genuine problem and meet with children's needs, or whether, as with other moral panics, they serve as vehicles for general social anxieties about trends in contemporary life or are tactical for special interest groups. . . . Technological change enabling marketing to "niche" audiences, and a more liberal moral climate, make it difficult for groups with a conservative social agenda to denounce graphic violence as long as it is seen as a private issue for adults. Basing claims on its effects on children circumvents this problem, as they can be more easily presented as victims.

### Jeffrey G. Johnson et al. "Television Viewing and Aggressive Behavior During Adolescence and Adulthood." *Science* 295 (2002): 2468+.

Three to five violent acts are depicted in an average hour of prime-time television and 20 to 25 violent acts are depicted in an average hour of children's television . . . Research has indicated that viewing television violence is associated with aggressive behavior . . . We report findings of the Children in the Community Study, a community-based longitudinal investigation that meets these methodological criteria. . . .

The present findings indicate that extensive television viewing by adolescents and young adults is associated with an increased likelihood of committing aggressive acts against others.

### Joanne Savage. "Does Viewing Violent Media Really Cause Criminal Violence? A Methodological Review." *Aggression and Violent Behavior* 10 (2004): 99-128.

Abstract: The topic of media violence has been the subject of heated debate in recent decades. There is a vast empirical literature on the effects of television on aggression but no published comprehensive review has ever focused on those studies that use criminal aggression as their outcome. . . . Although the possibility that television and film violence has an impact on violent criminality remains, it is concluded here that, despite persistent published reviews that state the contrary, the body of published, empirical evidence on this topic does not establish that viewing violent portrayals causes crime.